



John P. Franklin, Sr. City Council Building
Chattanooga, Tennessee

COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES

July 16, 2019

6:00 PM

CALL TO ORDER

Council Chairman Erskine Oglesby called the meeting to order with a quorum present, including Councilpersons Carol Berz, Anthony Byrd, Demetrus Coonrod, Russell Gilbert, Darrin Ledford, Jerry Mitchell and Ken Smith. Phil Noblett, City Attorney, and Nicole Gwyn, Council Clerk, were also present. Vice-Chairman Chip Henderson was not present this meeting.

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Chairman Oglesby led the Assembly in the Pledge of Allegiance.

APPROVAL OF LAST MINUTES

On motion of Councilman Gilbert and seconded by Councilman Smith, the minutes of the last meeting (July 9, 2019) were approved as published.

FALLEN FIVE REMEMBRANCE

Councilman Ledford led a tribute marking the 4th anniversary of the shooting at two military installations in Chattanooga on July 16, 2015. He recognized the Fallen Five: Sgt. Carson A. Holmquist, Navy Petty Officer 2nd Class Randall Smith, Gunnery Sgt. Thomas J. Sullivan, Lance Cpl. Squire "Skip" Wells and Staff Sgt. David A. Wyatt.

ORDINANCES – FINAL READING:

2019-065

Lyle Finley Trust % Arnold Trackett

Planning Version

District No. 4

On motion of Councilman Ledford and seconded by Councilman Smith,

ORDINANCE #13480

AN ORDINANCE TO AMEND CHATTANOOGA CITY CODE, PART II, CHAPTER 38, ZONING ORDINANCE, SO AS TO REZONE PART OF AN UNADDRESSED PROPERTY LOCATED IN THE 8200 BLOCK OF APISON PIKE, MORE PARTICULARLY DESCRIBED HEREIN, FROM R-1 RESIDENTIAL ZONE TO C-2 CONVENIENCE COMMERCIAL ZONE, SUBJECT TO CERTAIN CONDITIONS.

ACTION: APPROVED

2019-071
N&R Properties % Ross Timoshchuk
Planning Version
District No. 6

On motion of Councilwoman Berz and seconded by Councilman Gilbert,

ORDINANCE #13481

AN ORDINANCE TO AMEND CHATTANOOGA CITY CODE, PART II, CHAPTER 38, ZONING ORDINANCE, SO AS TO REZONE PROPERTY LOCATED AT 5613 CLARK ROAD, MORE PARTICULARLY DESCRIBED HEREIN, FROM R-1 RESIDENTIAL ZONE TO C-2 CONVENIENCE COMMERCIAL ZONE AND R-3 RESIDENTIAL ZONE, SUBJECT TO CERTAIN CONDITIONS.

ACTION: APPROVED

2019-072
Barry Payne Development % Barry Payne
Planning Version
District No. 6

Agenda Item V(c):

AN ORDINANCE TO AMEND CHATTANOOGA CITY CODE, PART II, CHAPTER 38, ZONING ORDINANCE, SO AS TO REZONE PROPERTIES LOCATED IN THE 7200 BLOCK OF BONNY OAKS DRIVE, MORE PARTICULARLY DESCRIBED HEREIN, FROM R-1 RESIDENTIAL ZONE TO R-4 SPECIAL ZONE, SUBJECT TO CERTAIN CONDITIONS.

Councilwoman Berz moved to defer to July 23, 2019. She was seconded by Councilman Ledford. The motion carried.

ACTION: DEFERRED TO JULY 23, 2019

2019-064
Leopoldo Vargas
Planning Version
District No. 7

On motion of Councilwoman Berz and seconded by Councilman Smith,

ORDINANCE #13483

AN ORDINANCE TO AMEND CHATTANOOGA CITY CODE, PART II, CHAPTER 38, ZONING ORDINANCE, SO AS TO REZONE PROPERTY LOCATED AT 3509 7TH AVENUE, MORE PARTICULARLY DESCRIBED HEREIN, FROM R-1 RESIDENTIAL ZONE TO C-2 CONVENIENCE COMMERCIAL ZONE.

Councilwoman Berz noted this was in Chairman Oglesby's district. The motion carried.

ACTION: APPROVED

2019-067
Berry Engineers % Ben Berry
Planning Version
District No. 7

On motion of Councilman Ledford and seconded by Councilman Smith,

ORDINANCE #13484

AN ORDINANCE TO AMEND CHATTANOOGA CITY CODE, PART II, CHAPTER 38, ZONING ORDINANCE, SO AS TO REZONE PROPERTIES IN THE 3700 THROUGH 3900 BLOCKS OF SAINT ELMO AVENUE, MORE PARTICULARLY DESCRIBED HEREIN, FROM C-2 CONVENIENCE COMMERCIAL ZONE TO UGC URBAN GENERAL COMMERCIAL ZONE, SUBJECT TO CERTAIN CONDITIONS.

Councilman Ledford noted this was in Chairman Oglesby's district. The motion carried.

ACTION: APPROVED

2019-077
Lee Helena
Planning Version
District No. 8

On motion of Councilman Byrd and seconded by Councilman Ledford,

ORDINANCE #13485

AN ORDINANCE TO AMEND CHATTANOOGA CITY CODE, PART II, CHAPTER 38, ZONING ORDINANCE, SO AS TO REZONE PROPERTY LOCATED AT 1505 EAST 14TH STREET, MORE PARTICULARLY DESCRIBED HEREIN, FROM R-1 RESIDENTIAL ZONE TO R-T/Z RESIDENTIAL TOWNHOUSE/ZERO LOT LINE ZONE, SUBJECT TO CERTAIN CONDITIONS.

ACTION: APPROVED

On motion of Councilman Ledford and seconded by Councilwoman Berz,

ORDINANCE #13482
(Renumbered since first reading)

AN ORDINANCE AMENDING CHATTANOOGA CITY CODE, PART II, CHAPTER 38, ZONING ORDINANCE, ARTICLE V, ZONING REGULATIONS, DIVISION 28, A-1 URBAN AGRICULTURAL ZONE, SECTION 38-453, PERMITTED USES AND ADDING NEW SECTION 38-460 REGARDING APPLICABILITY.

ACTION: APPROVED

ORDINANCES – FIRST READING:

On motion of Councilman Mitchell and seconded by Councilman Ledford,

ORDINANCE #13486

AN ORDINANCE AMENDING CHATTANOOGA CITY CODE, PART II, CHAPTER 31, SEWERS, MAIN AND DRAINS, ARTICLE VIII, STORMWATER MANAGEMENT, DIVISION 2, RELATIVE TO NEW DEVELOPMENT AND REDEVELOPMENT REQUIREMENTS AND AMENDING DIVISION 7 RELATIVE TO FEES.

ACTION: PASSED ON FIRST READING

RESOLUTIONS:

2019-29
Wade H. Robinson, Jr.
District No. 8

On motion of Councilman Byrd and seconded by Councilman Smith,

RESOLUTION #29990

A RESOLUTION APPROVING SHORT TERM VACATION RENTAL APPLICATION NO. 19-STVR-00088 FOR PROPERTY (HOUSE) LOCATED AT 1416 MADISON STREET.

Councilman Byrd informed the Council that he has spoken with the community and the Applicant, and have their support. The motion carried.

ACTION: ADOPTED

2019-30
Wade H. Robinson, Jr.
District No. 8

On motion of Councilman Byrd and Councilman Smith,

RESOLUTION #29991

A resolution approving Short Term Vacation Rental Application No. 19-STVR-00094 for property (ADU) located at 1416 Madison Street.

Councilman Byrd reiterated having the support of this community in this case. The motion carried.

ACTION: ADOPTED

On motion of Councilman Ledford and seconded by Councilman Smith,

RESOLUTION #29992

A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE CHIEF OF THE CHATTANOOGA FIRE DEPARTMENT TO EXTEND THE SUPPLEMENTAL FIRE SERVICES AGREEMENT WITH TRI COMMUNITY VOLUNTEER FIRE DEPARTMENT FOR TWO (2) YEARS, FOR A TOTAL AMOUNT OF \$267,928.00.

Councilman Ledford asked Fire Chief Phil Hyman to provide a map of the coverage areas that the City is under contract with Tri-Community Fire Department. Chief Hyman agreed.

ACTION: ADOPTED

On motion of Councilman Gilbert and seconded by Councilman Byrd,

RESOLUTION #29993

A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE APPOINTMENT OF DEWAYNE WALKER, AS A SPECIAL POLICE OFFICER (UNARMED) FOR THE LAND DEVELOPMENT OFFICE IN THE DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT, TO DO SPECIAL DUTY AS PRESCRIBED HEREIN, SUBJECT TO CERTAIN CONDITIONS.

ACTION: ADOPTED

On motion of Councilman Gilbert and seconded by Councilwoman Coonrod,

RESOLUTION #29994

A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE AWARD OF CONTRACT NO. W-18-019-201 TO SAK CONSTRUCTION, LLC OF O'FALLON, MO, SOUTH CHICKAMAUGA INTERCEPTOR IMPROVEMENTS - PHASE 1, FOR A CONTRACT AMOUNT OF \$5,373,000.00.

ACTION: ADOPTED

On motion of Councilman Mitchell and seconded by Councilman Smith,

RESOLUTION #29995

A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE APPROVAL OF CHANGE ORDER NO. 1 (FINAL) FOR TRI-STATE ROOFING CONTRACTOR, LLC OF CHATTANOOGA, TN, RELATIVE TO CONTRACT NO. Y-18-003-201, REPLACEMENT ROOFING SYSTEM FOR SOUTH CHATTANOOGA CENTER BUILDING, FOR AN INCREASED AMOUNT OF \$8,011.00, TO RELEASE THE REMAINING CONTINGENCY AMOUNT OF \$21,489.00, FOR A REVISED CONTRACT AMOUNT OF \$302,355.00.

ACTION: ADOPTED

On motion of Councilman Mitchell and seconded by Councilman Byrd,

RESOLUTION #29996

A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE STREET NAMING THE 200 BLOCK OF AN UNNAMED ALLEY BETWEEN WILLIAMS STREET AND COWART STREET TO THE 200 BLOCK OF COWARTSIDE ALLEY FOR MORE ACCURATE PROVISIONS OF EMERGENCY SERVICES.

ACTION: ADOPTED

On motion of Councilman Byrd and seconded by Councilwoman Coonrod,

RESOLUTION #29997

A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE AWARD OF CONTRACT NO. Y-15-008-803 TO CBI GROUP OF CHATTANOOGA, TN, AVONDALE YFD CENTER FFE FURNITURE, IN THE AMOUNT OF \$164,099.28, WITH A CONTINGENCY AMOUNT OF \$8,900.72, FOR AN AMOUNT NOT TO EXCEED \$173,000.00.

ACTION: ADOPTED

On motion of Councilman Mitchell and seconded by Councilman Ledford,

RESOLUTION #29998

A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE ADMINISTRATOR FOR THE DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION TO ENTER INTO A PARTNERSHIP AGREEMENT WITH BRISTOL CHATTANOOGA PARTNERS, LLC, PROJECT NO. T-20-001, FOR THE SOMERVILLE CONNECTOR CONSTRUCTION PROJECT, AND TO ACCEPT THE DESIGN AND A CONTRIBUTION OF FIFTY (50%) PERCENT UP TO \$250,000.00.

ACTION: ADOPTED

On motion of Councilman Mitchell and seconded by Councilman Ledford,

RESOLUTION #29999

A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE ADMINISTRATOR FOR THE DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION TO APPLY FOR AND, IF AWARDED, ACCEPT AN ADVANCED TRANSPORTATION AND CONGESTION MANAGEMENT TECHNOLOGIES DEPLOYMENT GRANT FROM THE UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION FOR THE CHATTANOOGA AREA FIRST RESPONDER AND MULTIMODAL SYSTEMS APPLICATION, WITH A LOCAL MATCH PROVIDED BY CITY AND COUNTY IN-KIND CONTRIBUTION NOT TO EXCEED \$2.6 MILLION, FOR A TOTAL AMOUNT NOT TO EXCEED \$5.1 MILLION.

ACTION: ADOPTED

DEPARTMENTAL REPORTS:

Emergency Purchase

Bonnie Woodward, Purchasing Director, informed the Council of the following emergency purchase:

PO 554560 - Department of Youth and Family Development Total Purchase \$45,178.30

Emergency Purchase - Liability Insurance for
Social Services - Department of Youth and Family Development

Supplier: Public Entity Partners
 5100 Maryland Way
 Brentwood, TN 37027

The purchase letter was signed in this open meeting by Ariel Ford, YFD's Office of Early Learning Director.

Proposed Purchases

Ms. Woodward briefed the Council on the following proposed purchases:

**R186886 R186902 R187063 R187152 R187252,
R187297 R187299 R187301 R187382, et.seq Total Estimate \$21,980,000.00 Annually**

Eleven (11) New Blanket Contract - Citywide Utility
Service Payments - Finance Department

Lowest/Best Bidders: Atlanta Gas
 Tennessee American Water
 City of Ringgold
 Clinton Utilities
 Eastside Utility District
 Hixson Utility District
 Lenoir City Utility Board
 North Georgia Electric Membership Corporation
 Savannah Valley Utility District
 Volunteer Energy Cooperative
 Electric Power Board of Chattanooga

R181806 - Chattanooga Police Department Estimated \$490,000.00 Annually

New Blanket Contract - Police Officer Uniforms - Chattanooga Police Department

Lowest/Best Bidder: Summit Uniforms
 3411 Amnicola Hwy
 Chattanooga, TN 37406

R184887 - Public Works Department

Total \$52,211.00

Purchase of - Hunter WinAligner & Scissor Lift –
Fleet Management Division - Public Works Department
Lowest/Best Bidder: Myers Tire Supply
1293 South Main Street
Akron, OH 44301

PO551686 - Public Works Department

Increase 40,000.00 ~~~~~

Revised Total Estimate \$140,000.00 Annually

Increase to Authorized Expenditure of
Blanket Contract - Root Control Services –
Waste Resources Division - Public Works Department
Lowest/Best Bidder: Duke's Root Control
1020 Hiawatha Blvd. West
Syracuse, NY 13204

R185712 - Public Works Department

Estimated \$35,000.00 Annually

New Blanket Contract - Grounds Maintenance for
Enterprise South Industrial Park - City Wide Services –
Public Works Department
Lowest/Best Bidder: R & A Property Maintenance
865 Old State Hwy 28
Dunlap, TN 37327

PO544600 - Public Works Department

Estimated \$125,000 Annually

Blanket Contract Renewal - High Visibility Work Clothes –
City Wide Services - Public Works Department
Lowest/Best Bidder: Reflective Apparel Factory, Inc
1649 Sands Place, Suite J
Marietta, GA 30067

PO551384 - Public Works Department

Estimated \$30,000.00 Annually

Blanket Contract Renewal - Custodial Services
at Miller Park Complex - Parks Division –
Public Works Department
Lowest/Best Bidder: Jani-King of Chattanooga
7610 Hamilton Park Drive Suites 3 & 4
Chattanooga, TN 37421

PO550984 - Public Works Department

Estimated \$140,000.00 Annually

Blanket Contract Renewal - Grounds Maintenance
for Birchwood & Summit Landfills - City Wide Services –
Public Works Department
Lowest/Best Bidder: Lovin Contracting Company, Inc.
P.O. Box 758
Robbinsville, NC 28771

PO550443 - Public Works Department

Estimated \$125,000.00 Annually

Blanket Contract Renewal - Grounds Maintenance for
City Right-of-Ways - City Wide Services - Public Works Department
Lowest/Best Bidder: Special Touch Lawn Care
4608 Woodmore View Circle
Chattanooga, TN 37411

PO545249 PO545251 PO545253 - Public Works Department Total Estimate \$900,000.00 Annually

Three (3) Blanket Contract Renewals - Service Repair & Parts
on all Medium and Heavy Duty Vehicles - Fleet Management Division –
Public Works Department

Lowest/Best Bidders:

1. Chattanooga Truck Center, Inc. 1716 Church Road Chattanooga, TN 37421
2. MHC Kenworth dba Tennessee Kenworth, Inc. 7831 Lee Hwy. Chattanooga, TN 37421
3. Lee-Smith, Inc. 2600 8th Avenue Chattanooga, TN 37407

PO550688 PO550689 - Public Works Department

Total Estimate \$31,000.00 Annually

Two (2) Blanket Contracts Renewals - Grounds Maintenance
for City Park Levees & Greenway - Parks Division –
Public Works Department

Lowest/Best Bidders:

1. Sikes Services, LLC dba City Green Services - 206 Merriman Avenue, Chattanooga, TN 37415
2. Special Touch Lawn Care - 4608 Woodmere View Circle, Chattanooga, TN 37411

PO545300 PO545303 - Public Works Department

Total Estimate \$160,000.00 Annually

Two (2) Blanket Contracts Renewals –
Generator Maintenance & Repair Services –
City Wide - Facilities Management Division - Public Works Department

Lowest/Best Bidder:

1. Energy Systems Southeast, LLC - 3235 Veterans Circle, Birmingham, AL 35235
2. Stowers Machinery Corporation - 4066 South Access Road, Chattanooga, TN 37406

PO544978 - Public Works Department

Estimate \$2,500,000.00 Annually

Blanket Contract Renewal - Liquid Calcium Nitrate –
Waste Resources Division - Public Works Department
Lowest/Best Bidder: Evoqua Water Technologies, LLC
2155 112th Avenue
Holland, MI 49424

PO544489 - Public Works Division

Estimated \$150,000.00 Annually

Blanket Contract Renewal - Sewer Pipe –
Waste Resources Division - Public Works Department
Lowest/Best Bidder: Consolidated Pipe & Supply
7724 Ballcamp Pike
Knoxville, TN 37931

On motion of Councilman Ledford and seconded by Councilman Byrd, all proposed purchases were approved.

ACTION: ALL PURCHASES APPROVED

OTHER BUSINESS:

Anonymous Donation

Maura Sullivan, Chief of Operations, informed the Council of an anonymous donation of to YFD's Office of Early Learning has received a gift in the amount of \$13,200 from an anonymous donor through the Community Foundation of Greater Chattanooga. This gift is specifically to support professional development of child care providers in curriculum implementation.

Congratulatory Remarks

Chairman Oglesby informed the Council that Attorney Noblett became a grandfather last week. Attorney Noblett stated that Gabriel Joseph Noblett was born on July 13, 2019. He weighed 9.8 ounces.

District 7 Event

[Editor's Note: Chairman Oglesby originally announced the Southside Movie in the Park for July 20, 2019, but it was subsequently postponed to August 3, 2019 due to possible thunderstorms.]

COMMITTEE REPORTS:

Budget and Finance Committee

Councilwoman Berz

(No report)

Economic and Community Development Committee

Councilman Byrd

(No report)

Human Resources Committee

Councilman Gilbert

(No report)

Planning and Zoning Committee

Councilman Ledford

(No report)

Public Safety Committee

Councilman Smith

(No report)

Public Works and Transportation Committee

Councilman Mitchell reported:

- The committee will meet next week (July 23) immediately following YFD Committee.

Youth and Family Development Committee

Councilwoman Coonrod reported:

- The committee will meet next week immediately after the 3:00 p.m. Agenda Session.

Legislative Committee

(Vice-Chairman Henderson not present)

**RECOGNITION OF PERSONS WISHING TO ADDRESS COUNCIL
(Non-Agenda Items)**

Attorney Noblett read the rules of procedure for persons wishing to address the Council on non-agenda items. After which, Chairman Oglesby recognized the following persons:

- **Sylvester Harris** (Curtis St.) – He had concerns about the appointment of a retired police officer to the Police Advisory and Review Committee to which he also is appointed. He clarified not having a personal problem with the appointee or police officers, but does have concerns about being appointees to this particular committee being unbiased towards an organization they have been affiliated with in the past. He clarified that he did not come to persecute anyone or “go after” the police. He emphasized his support of the police and his desire for accountability. He believes the city would rather put a man in jail and house him for \$60,000 a year than put that money on the first part of his life. He wants a taxpayer, not a tax burden. It disturbs him to see that this city is ranked fourth for mismanagement. He wants us all to do the right thing. He reminded the Council that we all will one day be accountable. He hopes the Council and their families will look back at them and say that they did the right thing.
- **Marie Mott** (Oak Grove) – She informed the Council that the last incident of police brutality in Chattanooga struck Councilwoman Coonrod personally. She thanked Councilman Gilbert being the only Council member who supported Councilwoman Coonrod at the press conference after the Hamilton County Sheriff’s incident. She informed the Council that retired Assistant Chief Edwin McPherson and retired Captain Pedro Bacon were subpoenaed last week in the investigation of rape allegations. She commended Councilwoman Coonrod for her bravery in asking that the current Police Chief, who was over the Internal Affairs at the time of the alleged crime, to be investigated as well. She commented on the Council making a decision recently out of a comfort with the police. She noted that councilpersons do not know what it is to be an African American and be pulled over in their vehicle, be surveilled or have a stigma of color. She believes hindsight is 20/20. She asked the Council to think over its decisions and consider if we are seeing realistic outcomes. Have we liberated or She asked the Council to consider if the people have been liberated by any of its decision-making or place-making over the past three years for some and several years for others. She apologized to Councilwoman Coonrod for not having seeing the support of her colleagues. She emphasized that the community is standing with Councilwoman Coonrod.
- **Keeli Crewe** (Chattanooga) - She is a business owner at 721 Broad Street. She reminded the Council of the city’s mantra to rally the people, not run over them. She discussed how citizens were given the choice in funding infrastructure for fiber optics, participated in visioning meetings that led to the waterfront revitalization and private donations building

the Tennessee Aquarium. She believes the BID assessment will result in an increase the rent and shared taxes defined within their leases. She asked the Council to consider an alternative to the BID. She recommended that the Council convert the River City business model to a board membership, such as the Chamber of Commerce, Visitors Bureau, Green Spaces and Association of Visual Arts, all of which are member supported. She proposed that then the property owners advocating for the BID could become members and donate the same amount of the money based on property footage rather than setting up a self-imposed tax. As a member-supported organization, River City members could then be recognized for their tax-deductible altruistic support in all River City annual reports, advertisements and public relations. They could also be named as “corporate sponsors” for all future creative space-making, such as the Passageways, City Thread at Cooper’s Alley and other public arts spaces. She suggested that membership donations could also be used to continue the weekly music in Miller Plaza and Miller Park, and the art and Farmer’s Market at Waterhouse Pavilion. She informed the Council that New York City BIDs forced out many “mom & pop” businesses, due to increased cost and overhead. Asheville, NC and Alexandria, VA voted down a BID for this reason. Savannah dropped their BID after two years because of mismanagement of funds. She noted that New York City now has 74 BIDs. She discussed how the BID would set a precedence where a few unelected boards will determine the direction of a particular part of the city. She asked why create an additional tax when there are existing agencies working with city government to perform these services proposed by the BID?

- **Denise Reed** (Chattanooga) – She represents the Concierge Office Suites, located at 633 Chestnut Street. She not only represents her own business, but also over 60 businesses that operate out of her business address for full-service office space within the footprint of the BID. She has spoken to several property owners against the BID who were absent while other property owners were advocating and believes they are “picking their battles.” She listed several examples of how property owners have already contributed to the beautification of this city from their own private funds by revitalizing and/or repurposing such buildings as the McClellan, First Tennessee, Read House, Clemmons Building, St. Barnabas. She also noted how the Defoors brothers have invested more than \$88 Million downtown and plan to invest \$10 Million more.
- **Darin Wright** (Chattanooga) – She is the owner of Elea Blake on Chestnut Street. Since Ms. Reed did not have time to finish her statements on behalf of the business owners, she wanted to continue reading the group’s recommendations if this Council is determined to implement the BID. They propose amending the language of the BID so that none of the taxes may be passed through to lease tenants, business or residential. Despite what has been said in the contrary, she knows that taxes will be passed on to tenants because she has an email from her property manager that says so and includes the amount. The group recommends that the BID property owner’s square footage assessment be published and that the donors be recognized in district programs. They recommend an audit after the first and subsequent years that will give insight into whether or not the BID is working. Regarding dissolution of the BID, they recommend adding language to the ordinance, like in LA, that will only requires the justification of the City Council to dissolve the BID, thus, eliminating the costly fees. She continued with her own personal recommendations to the Council. First came to Chattanooga, owned bus over 22 years, raised children here, takes her business seriously, not fond of politics, must take a stand to say “We must say ‘no’” to the BID, stand and protect those who are looking for the opportunity to innovate and build something great. Taxation without rep is a travesty. She has always invested in areas that are not desirable at the time. Pioneers like herself hope for personal success as well as the success of those in their communities. Despite hardships as a small business owners, she thrives through hard work and their own marketing. Small businesses are the lifeblood of every city. Small businesses donate 250-percent more than large businesses.

- Councilman Gilbert asked Ms. Wright the name of her business and if it is within the BID. She informed him that Elea Blake is within the BID. He informed Ms. Wright that some business owners were allowed to speak at the last BID hearing, and did not see a reason why she could not speak. Ms. Wright noted that there was some confusion as to whether only property owners may speak at the BID. She indicated that she did plan to be here for the hearing in the hopes of being able to speak.
- **Rose Cox** – She owns the Palace Theatre on Patton Parkway. She stated that her business is dying due to all the taxes she must pay in this city. She pays taxes on so many things that does not need to pay at her other business in Florida. No told her how many taxes that she would have to pay in Chattanooga and no one ensures the mail delivers to taxpayers. She is still held responsible for taxes, even if the mail is not delivered to her. For her business in Florida, she only pays one income tax. She informed the Council that there are taxes written into her lease and believes there is no way around the taxes. She reminded the Council that she must pay musicians and artists no matter what the attendance at the venue. She pleaded for change this, or she will have to leave this city because she cannot afford to stay.
- **Elea Wright** (Chattanooga) – She spelled her first name for the Council since it was misspelled in the record of the meeting last time she appeared before them. She wanted to finish a statement from a previous speaker: that small businesses donate 250-percent more than large business in community causes and also pay a greater share of taxes. She believes that is because (1) small businesses don't have expensive attorneys and tax accountants to help them get out of loopholes, and (2) small business owners want to support the communities they are in. She lives here and cares about the people. She informed the Council that small businesses were not consulted by the BID. Therefore, she has been going door-to-door, asking if they know what the BID is; yet, no one knows what it is. She informed the Council that BIDs in other countries, states and counties have pushed out many small businesses in the name of "improvement." She informed the Council that when they say small businesses will end up paying for this, they are accused of spreading misinformation when our landlords, despite being told this by landlords about how much more they'll pay monthly. She informed the Council of fights to stop the expansion of BIDs in New York City and the fight to stop BIDs entirely in Ashville, NC. She believes that people enjoy cities for their individuality, not because of their chain establishments or number of hotels. She believes that cities rich in small business culture are more favored. She asked the Council to consider more creative and sustainable ways options to a BID. She urged the Council not to allow small business owners to be pushed into a 10-year sentence with no voice. She argued that we must say 'no' to taxation without representation, 'no' to an unelected board that will handle our hard-earned money, 'no' to assessments that can increase 5-percent annually regardless of ROIs and 'no' to redundant expenditures and loopholes that allowed the BID to be resurrected as a resolution to circumvent the required 365 days before it could be resubmitted by the Tennessee legislation. She considers this ordinance to be the most undemocratic method for establishing the BID and considers it to be a slap in the face to small businesses that have built equity downtown and all Chattanoogaans. She believes the right thing to do is listen to small business owners and create a more conducive environment for their success.

ADJOURNMENT

On motion of Councilman Ledford, Chairman Oglesby adjourned the meeting of the Chattanooga City Council until Tuesday, July 23, 2019, at 6:00 p.m.

CHAIRMAN

CLERK OF COUNCIL